

Polyphony in Medieval Paris

Polyphony associated with the Parisian Cathedral of Notre Dame marks a historical turning point in medieval music. Yet a lack of analytical or theoretical systems has discouraged close study of twelfth- and thirteenth-century musical objects, despite the fact that such creations represent the beginnings of musical composition as we know it. *Is musical analysis possible for such medieval repertoires?* Catherine A. Bradley demonstrates that it is, presenting new methodologies to illuminate processes of musical and poetic creation, from monophonic plainchant and vernacular French songs, to polyphonic organa, clausulae, and motets in both Latin and French. This book engages with questions of text–music relationships, liturgy, and the development of notational technologies, exploring concepts of authorship and originality as well as practices of quotation and musical reworking.

CATHERINE A. BRADLEY is Associate Professor at the University of Oslo. She has published widely on the earliest motets, in journals including *Speculum*, *Journal of Musicology*, *Music Analysis*, and *Early Music History*.

MUSIC IN CONTEXT

Series editors

J. P. E. Harper-Scott
Royal Holloway, University of London

Julian Rushton
University of Leeds

The aim of Music in Context is to illuminate specific musical works, repertoires, or practices in historical, critical, socio-economic, or other contexts; or to illuminate particular cultural and critical contexts in which music operates through the study of specific musical works, repertoires, or practices. A specific musical focus is essential, while avoiding the decontextualisation of traditional aesthetics and music analysis. The series title invites engagement with both its main terms; the aim is to challenge notions of what contexts are appropriate or necessary in studies of music, and to extend the conceptual framework of musicology into other disciplines or into new theoretical directions.

Books in the series

Simon P. Keefe, *Mozart's Requiem: Reception, Work, Completion*

J. P. E. Harper-Scott, *The Quilting Points of Musical Modernism: Revolution, Reaction, and William Walton*

Nancy November, *Beethoven's Theatrical Quartets: Opp. 59, 74, and 95*

Rufus Hallmark, *'Frauenliebe und Leben': Chamisso's Poems and Schumann's Songs*

Anna Zayaruznaya, *The Monstrous New Art: Divided Forms in the Late Medieval Motet*

Helen Deeming and Elizabeth Eva Leach, *Manuscripts and Medieval Song: Inscription, Performance, Context*

Emily Kilpatrick, *The Operas of Maurice Ravel*

Roderick Chadwick and Peter Hill, *Olivier Messiaen's 'Catalogue d'oiseaux': From Conception to Performance*

Catherine A. Bradley, *Polyphony in Medieval Paris: The Art of Composing with Plainchant*

Polyphony in Medieval Paris

The Art of Composing with Plainchant

CATHERINE A. BRADLEY
University of Oslo



CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

University Printing House, Cambridge CB2 8BS, United Kingdom

One Liberty Plaza, 20th Floor, New York, NY 10006, USA

477 Williamstown Road, Port Melbourne, VIC 3207, Australia

314–321, 3rd Floor, Plot 3, Splendor Forum, Jasola District Centre, New Delhi – 110025, India

79 Anson Road, #06-04/06, Singapore 079906

Cambridge University Press is part of the University of Cambridge.

It furthers the University's mission by disseminating knowledge in the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence.

www.cambridge.org

Information on this title: www.cambridge.org/9781108418584

DOI: 10.1017/9781108290456

© Catherine A. Bradley 2018

This publication is in copyright. Subject to statutory exception and to the provisions of relevant collective licensing agreements, no reproduction of any part may take place without the written permission of Cambridge University Press.

First published 2018

Printed in the United Kingdom by TJ International Ltd. Padstow Cornwall

A catalogue record for this publication is available from the British Library.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Bradley, Catherine A. author.

Title: Polyphony in Medieval Paris: The Art of Composing with Plainchant / Catherine A. Bradley.

Description: Cambridge, United Kingdom; New York, NY: Cambridge University Press, 2018. |

Series: Music in context | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2018013738 | ISBN 9781108418584 (hardback)

Subjects: LCSH: Music – 500–1400 – History and criticism. | Motets – 500–1400 – History and criticism. | Clausulas (Part songs) – History and criticism.

Classification: LCC ML172.B83 2018 | DDC 782.2/2–dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2018013738>

ISBN 978-1-108-41858-4 Hardback

Cambridge University Press has no responsibility for the persistence or accuracy of URLs for external or third-party internet websites referred to in this publication and does not guarantee that any content on such websites is, or will remain, accurate or appropriate.

Contents

<i>List of Figures</i>	[page vi]
<i>List of Musical Examples</i>	[vii]
<i>List of Tables</i>	[x]
<i>Acknowledgements</i>	[xi]
<i>Note on the Text</i>	[xiii]
<i>List of Manuscript Sigla</i>	[xv]
<i>List of Abbreviations</i>	[xvii]
Introduction	[1]
1 Plainchant in Polyphony: The Gradual <i>Propter veritatem</i> in Organa, Clausulae, and Motets	[10]
Appendix 1.1 VERITATEM Motets: Sources and Tenor Designations	[47]
Appendix 1.2 Motets on FILIA Tenors	[48]
2 Mini Clausulae and the <i>Magnus liber organi</i>	[49]
3 Texting Clausulae: Repetition and Regularity on the REGNAT Tenor	[81]
4 Transcribing Motets: Vernacular Refrain Melodies in <i>Magnus liber</i> Clausulae	[111]
5 Framing Motets: Quoting and Crafting Refrains against Plainchant Tenors	[146]
6 Intertextuality, Song, and Female Voices in Motets on a St Elizabeth of Hungary Tenor	[179]
7 From Florence to Fauvel: Rereading Musical Paradigms through a Long-Lived IOHANNE Motet	[212]
8 Conclusions	[247]
<i>Bibliography</i>	[258]
<i>Index of Compositions</i>	[270]
<i>General Index</i>	[273]

Figures

- 4.1 *Flos filius eius 4*, F, fol. 166r–4 (detail). Reproduced by permission of Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, MiBACT. Further reproduction by any means is prohibited. [page 120]
- 4.2 (a) F, fol. 164v (bottom half); (b) continued, fol. 165r (top half). Reproduced by permission of Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, MiBACT. Further reproduction by any means is prohibited. [122]
- 4.3 *Domine 2*, F, fol. 169r (detail). Reproduced by permission of Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, MiBACT. Further reproduction by any means is prohibited. [128]

Musical Examples

- 1.1 *Propter veritatem V. Audi filia*, Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 15615, fol. 332v. [page 14]
- 1.2 Typical polyphonic approach to the *Propter veritatem* chant, as recorded in Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 15615, fol. 332v. [16]
- 1.3 Melodies associated with *Veritatem* as a monophonic plainchant and a polyphonic tenor. [18]
- 1.4 Mini clausula on VERITATEM, F, fol. 183r–IV, 1. [20]
- 1.5 Melodic comparison of AUREM TUAM. [23]
- 1.6 Two versions of the FILIA melisma. [27]
- 1.7 The extended VERITATEM motet tenor. [32]
- 1.8 Variant motet versions of the FILIA melisma. [35]
- 2.1 Alleluia *Veni sancte spiritus*, M 27 organum tenor, F, fol. 119r–v. [57]
- 2.2 *Veni sancte spiritus reple* mini clausula (M 27), F, no. 389, fol. 181v–IV, 3. [58]
- 2.3 *Corda fidelium* mini clausula (M 27), F, no. 390, fol. 181v–V, 1. [59]
- 2.4 *In eis* mini clausula (M 27), F, no. 391, fol. 181v–VI, 1. [59]
- 2.5 *Et filio* mini clausula (O 10), F, no. 293, fol. 178r–VI, 2. [64]
- 2.6 *Et filio* mini clausula (O 11), F, no. 297, fol. 178v–I, 3. [64]
- 2.7 The opening respond of O 10 and O 11 in chant and polyphony. [65]
- 2.8 [*Compleren*]tur mini clausula (O 11), F, no. 295, fol. 178v–I, 1. [65]
- 3.1a Structure of the REGNAT melisma. [86]
- 3.1b Arrangement of the REG[NAT] melisma in *Reg[nat]* 6. [86]
- 3.1c Arrangement of the REG[NAT] melisma in *Reg[nat]* 8. [86]
- 3.2 *Reg[nat]* 6 clausula F, fol. 166r–6 (with W1, fol. 59r–4 variants shown). [87]
- 3.3 *Reg[nat]* 8 clausula, F, fol. 166r–7. [88]
- 3.4 *Deus omnium/REG[NAT]*, F, fol. 403v [94]
- 3.5 *Infidelem populum/REG[NAT]*, F, fol. 403r–v. [96]

- 3.6 Illustration of dissonance in *motetus coloratus* from Walter Odington's *De speculatione musicae*. [101]
- 4.1 (a) intertextual motet refrain vdB 287 in *Domino 12* and related motet. (b) VdB 287 in **StV** clausula transcription of *Mainte dame/IOHANNE*, fol. 290v. [124]
- 4.2 Transmission of vdB 1699: in *Immolatus est 9* clausula and related motets; in *Lautrier en mai/TANQUAM*. [125]
- 4.3 Transmission of vdB 237: in *Domine 2* clausula and related motets; in *Lautrier quant me chevauchioie/PRO [PATRIBUS]*. [127]
- 4.4 VdB 1157 in three **MANERE** motets. [130]
- 4.5 VdB 1157 in *Qui conservaret 7* clausula and related motet. [131]
- 4.6 *Ja pour longue demouree/DIES*, **Mo**, fols. 267v–268r. [133]
- 4.7 A new motet and clausula concordance for vdB 310 in *Lautrier quant me chevauchioie/PRO [PATRIBUS]*. [135]
- 4.8 Transmission of vdB 338 in the vernacular motetus *Lautrier jour mon alai* (Mt651). [138]
- 4.9 External concordances (outside Mt651) for vdB 338. [139]
- 5.1 *Ne m'oubliez mie/DOMINO*, **Mo**, fols. 261v–262r. [148]
- 5.2 *Domino 12* clausula, **F**, fol. 88v–4. [152]
- 5.3 Similar motetus incipits in three **DOMINO** motets. [160]
- 5.4 Opening and closing refrains in *Nus ne se doit/AUDI FILIA*, **Mo**, fols. 246v–247r. [162]
- 5.5 Comparing vdB 1395a and refrains in *Celui de cui/La bele estoile/La bele en cui/IOHANNE*, **Mo**, fols. 24v–27r. [164]
- 5.6 *Nus ne se doit/AUDI FILIA*, **Mo**, fols. 246v–247r (with selected variants shared by **N**, fol. 187v and **R**, fol. 208r shown above the staff). [166]
- 5.7 Tenor–motetus relationships and phrase structures in *Nus ne se doit/AUDI FILIA*, **Mo**, fols. 246v–247r. [167]
- 5.8 Similar framing refrains in **AUDI FILIA** motets. [171]
- 5.9 Opening and closing phrases of *M'ocirres voz/AUDI FILIA*, **Mo**, fol. 250r–v (with hypothetical alternative tenor realisations). [173]
- 5.10 Established version of **AUDI FILIA** tenor melisma adopted (but altered) in *M'ocirres* and *Biaus cuers*. [173]
- 5.11 Opening and closing phrases of *Biaus cuers desires/AUDI FILIA*, **Mo**, fols. 255v–256r (with hypothetical alternative tenor realisations). [174]
- 6.1 Responsory *Ante dies exitus* from *Gaudeat Hungaria*. [184]
- 6.2 *Un chant renvoisie/DECANTATUR*, **ArsB**, fol. 14r. [187]
- 6.3 Three versions of the **DECANTATUR** melody. [192]

- 6.4 *Douce dame sanz pitie/SUSTINERE*, **W2**, fols. 228v–229r. [197]
- 6.5 *Amis, vostre demoree/PRO PATRIBUS (sic)*, **Mo**, fol. 249r. [201]
- 6.6 Comparison of motetus openings in *Amis, vostre demoree* and *Un chant renvoisie*. [203]
- 7.1 Conventional form of IOHANNE melisma. [218]
- 7.2 Comparison of *Iohanne 3 clausula* and motet tenor with the conventional IOHANNE melisma. [219]
- 7.3 *Iohanne 3 clausula*, **F**, fol. 164v–1. [222]
- 7.4 *Ne sai que je die/IOHANNE*, **W2**, fol. 219av. [224]
- 7.5 *Clamans in deserto/IOHAN[NE]*, **F**, fol. 409v. [225]
- 7.6 Opening of *Quant vient en mai/Ne sai que je die/AMORIS (sic)*, **Ba**, fols. 44r–45r. [234]

Tables

- 1.1 Organum settings of *Propter veritatem* (M 37) [page 16]
- 1.2 Clausulae on M 37 tenors [27]
- 1.3 Organum and clausula settings of FILIA [28]
- 2.1 Office mini clausulae [67]
- 2.2 Mass mini clausulae [70]
- 3.1 Text and translation of *Deus omnium* [94]
- 3.2 Text and translation of *Infidelem populum* [98]
- 4.1 *Magnus liber* clausulae containing refrain melodies [115]
- 4.2 Text and translation of *Ja pour longue demoree* [134]
- 5.1 Refrains 1361 and 287 and their motet concordances [150]
- 5.2 Text and translation of *Ne m'oubliez mie* [158]
- 5.3 Text and translation of *Nus ne se doit repentir* [170]
- 6.1 Text and translation of *Ante dies exitus* [184]
- 6.2 Text and translation of *Un chant renvoisie* [189]
- 6.3 Text and translation of *Amis, vostre demoree* [204]
- 7.1 Polyphonic elaborations of IOHANNE in the *Magnus liber* [217]
- 7.2 Comparing IOHANNE motet texts [228]
- 7.3 **Fauvel** interpolations with concordances in the thirteenth-century motet repertoire [240]

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I wish to thank Rebecca Maloy – who reviewed this book with care, generosity, and insight, and improved it immeasurably – and Mark Everist, whose reading of the complete manuscript was invaluable.

I am deeply indebted to Susan Rankin, under whose supervision ideas for this project began, and to Elizabeth Eva Leach: both have offered me unstinting kindness, guidance, and encouragement. I am also grateful to Emma Dillon for her very thoughtful and constructive response to the material in its early stages.

I wish to thank, in particular, those who so generously read drafts of individual chapters, offering detailed and extensive feedback that proved transformative: Edward H. Roesner, Rebecca A. Baltzer, Sarah Fuller, Lawrence Earp, David Maw, Dolores Pesce, Elizabeth Eva Leach and her Graduate and Postdoc Reading Group, Susan Rankin and her Covent Garden Seminar.

I have benefited immensely from conversations resulting from presentations of this material at the *Ars Antiqua* conference in Southampton in 2013; the Medieval Renaissance Music Conference in 2013, 2014, 2016, and 2017; the Yale Song Lab in 2014; the Annual Meeting of the American Musicological Society in 2014 and 2016; the Annual Meeting of the Medieval Academy of America in 2015; and the Novacella International Symposium on Late Medieval Music in 2017.

The completion of this book has been made possible by the following grants and fellowships: a Junior Research Fellowship at The Queen's College, Oxford; Grants from the Faculty of the Arts, Humanities, and Social Sciences, and the Arts, Humanities, and Lettered Social Sciences Faculty Research Programme at the State University of New York at Stony Brook; a Visiting Fellowship at St Catherine's College, Oxford; and a EURIAS Fellowship (co-funded by Marie Skłodowska-Curie Actions under the 7th Framework Programme) at the Institut d'Etudes Avancées de Paris.

I warmly thank all those who have contributed to this project, offering valuable insights and assistance, especially Wulf Arlt, Sam Barrett, Nicolas Bell, Margaret Bent, Katherine Butler, Ardis Butterfield, David Catalunya, Sean Curran, Karen Desmond, Eleanor Giraud, Huw Grange, Andrew Hicks, Henry Hope, Sylvia Huot, Sara Lipton, Henry Parkes, Thomas Payne,

Owen Rees, Gaël Saint-Cricq, Jennifer Saltzstein, Matthew Thomson, and Anna Zayaruznaya.

I am grateful to Kate Brett, Paul Harper-Scott, and Julian Rushton for their help and solicitude throughout the publication process. I acknowledge the Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, which provided the book's images, and the American Musicological Society for their generous offer of a subvention from the Kenneth Levy Endowment, funded in part by the National Endowment for the Humanities and the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.

My profound thanks go to all of the colleagues, friends, and family – particularly my parents – who have unfailingly supported me throughout.

Note on the Text

Transcriptions

Original text spellings are retained. Capitalisation, punctuation, and text-line numbers are editorial.

Square brackets indicate editorial insertions.

Round brackets indicate erasures.

In transcriptions of plainchant, slurs indicate ligatures, dashed slurs indicate conjuncturae, and liquescents are shown by joined pitches. An asterisk indicates the juncture between a solo and a choral section of the plainchant.

In transcriptions of polyphony, ligatures are indicated by square brackets, conjuncturae by dashed slurs. Plicae are shown by a line through the stem, and in unmeasured polyphonic transcriptions plicae are indicated by slurs. Repetitions of the tenor plainchant melody (cursus) are numbered beneath the stave in roman numerals.

The medieval note value of the long (*longa*) corresponds to a crotchet in modern notation, a ternary long (*longa trium temporum*) to a dotted crotchet. The breve (*brevis*) is equivalent to a quaver in transcription.

The term 'perfection' refers to the length of a dotted crotchet in transcription. In the early thirteenth century this is described as a ternary long (*longa trium temporum*). For the sake of concision, the later-thirteenth-century term of perfect long (*longa perfectum*) or perfection is adopted throughout as the unit by which musical time is measured.

Numbering Systems

Motet numbers – from Friedrich Gennrich, *Bibliographie der ältesten französischen und lateinischen Motetten*, SMMA 2 (Frankfurt, 1957) – are prefaced by Mt.

Clausula folio numbers are followed by an arabic numeral that indicates their position in the sequence of clausulae on this folio.

For the shorter so-called mini clausulae (F, fols. 178r–183v), the folio number is followed by a roman numeral that identifies the stave on which the mini clausula is copied, and then by an arabic numeral that indicates its position in the sequence of mini clausulae on this stave.

Clausula numbers in F follow those in the edition by Rebecca A. Baltzer, *Le 'Magnus liber organi' de Notre-Dame de Paris V: Les clausules à deux voix du manuscrit de Florence, Biblioteca Medicea-Laurenziana, Pluteus 29.1, fascicule V* (Monaco, 1995).

Manuscript Sigla

ArsA	Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, 135
ArsB	Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, 3517–18
ArsC	Paris, Bibliothèque de l'Arsenal, 8521
Ba	Bamberg, Staatsbibliothek, Lit. 115 (formerly Ed.IV.6)
Basel	Basel, Universitäts Bibliothek, Fragmentensammlung F X 37
Ber	Berlin, Staatsbibliothek der Stiftung Preussischer Kulturbesitz, lat. 4° 523
Bes	Besançon, Bibliothèque municipale, I, 716
Ca	Cambrai, Médiathèque d'agglomération (formerly Bibliothèque municipale), A 410
Ch	Châlons-en-Champagne, Archives départementales de la Marne, 3.J.250
Cl	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, nouv. acq. fr. 13521, 'La Clayette'
CTr	Cambridge, Trinity College, O.2.1
Da	Darmstadt, Hessische Landesbibliothek, 3471
Douce 308	Oxford, Bodleian Library, Douce 308
Erf	Erfurt, Wissenschaftliche Bibliothek, fol. 169
F	Florence, Biblioteca Medicea Laurenziana, Plut. 29.1
Fauvel	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fr. 146, 'Roman de Fauvel'
Her	Louvain, Bibliothèque universitaire, no shelf mark (now destroyed: photographs in Göttingen, Universitätsbibliothek, Ludwig Nachlass, IX, 14)
Hu	Burgos, Monasterio de Las Huelgas, 11 (formerly IX)
LoA	London, British Library, Egerton 2615
LoB	London, British Library, Egerton 274
LoC	London, British Library, Add. 30091
LoD	London, British Library, Add. 27630
LoHa	London, British Library, Harley 978
Lyell	Oxford, Bodleian Library, Lyell 72
Ma	Madrid, Biblioteca nacional, 20486 (formerly Hh 167)
Mo	Montpellier, Bibliothèque interuniversitaire, Section de médecine, H. 196
MüA	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, Mus.ms. 4775 (gallo-rom. 42) and fragments in Berlin, Staatsbibliothek zu

	Berlin, Musikabteilung 55 MS 14 (formerly in the private library of Johannes Wolf, Berlin)
MüB	Munich, Bayerische Staatsbibliothek, lat. 16444 (Musikfragmente E III 230–1)
N	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fr. 12615, 'Noailles chansonnier'
PsAr	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 11266
R	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fr. 844, 'Manuscrit du Roi'
Reg	Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Regina 1543 (fragments)
Silos	Santo Domingo de Silos, Biblioteca de monasteria, MS s.n.
StS1	Stary Sącz, Konwent Swaty Kingy, D.2
StV	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, lat. 15139, 'St Victor'
Trouv. C	Bern, Stadtbibliothek, 389
Trouv. U	Paris, Bibliothèque nationale de France, fr. 20050
Vat	Rome, Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Regina 1490
W1	Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, Cod. Guelf. 628 Helmst. (Heinemann no. 677)
W2	Wolfenbüttel, Herzog August Bibliothek, Cod. Guelf. 1099 Helmst. (Heinemann no. 1206)
Worc	Worcester, Cathedral Library, Add. 68; Oxford, Bodleian Library, Lat. lit. d. 20; and London, British Library, Add. 25031

Abbreviations

BVM	Blessed Virgin Mary
CSM	Corpus scriptorum de musica
M	Mass Chant number as assigned in Friedrich Ludwig, <i>Repertorium organorum recentioris et motetorum vetustissimi stili</i> , ed. Luther A. Dittmer, 2 vols. in 3 (New York, 1964–78 [1910])
Mt	Motet number in Friedrich Gennrich, <i>Bibliographie der ältesten französischen und lateinischen Motetten</i> , SMMA 2 (Frankfurt, 1957)
NOHM	New Oxford History of Music
O	Office Chant number as assigned in Friedrich Ludwig, <i>Repertorium organorum recentioris et motetorum vetustissimi stili</i> , ed. Luther A. Dittmer, 2 vols. in 3 (New York, 1964–78 [1910])
PMMM	Publications of Mediaeval Musical Manuscripts
RRMMA	Recent Researches in the Music of the Middle Ages and Early Renaissance
SMMA	Summa musicae medii aevi
vdB	Refrain number in Nico van den Boogaard, <i>Rondeaux et refrains du XIII^e siècle au début du XIV^e</i> , Bibliothèque française et romane, Série D: Initiation, textes et documents 3 (Paris, 1969)
WMB	Wiener musikwissenschaftliche Beiträge

Cambridge University Press
978-1-108-41858-4 — Polyphony in Medieval Paris
Catherine A. Bradley
Frontmatter
[More Information](#)
